

# City of Glendale

5850 West Glendale Avenue  
Glendale, AZ 85301



## Meeting Minutes - Final

Tuesday, May 5, 2015

12:30 PM

Special Voting Meeting

Council Chambers

### City Council

*Mayor Jerry Weiers*

*Vice Mayor Ian Hugh*

*Councilmember Jamie Aldama*

*Councilmember Samuel Chavira*

*Councilmember Gary Sherwood*

*Councilmember Lauren Tolmachoff*

*Councilmember Bart Turner*

**CALL TO ORDER**

**Present:** 7 - Mayor Jerry Weiers, Vice Mayor Ian Hugh, Councilmember Jamie Aldama, Councilmember Samuel Chavira, Councilmember Gary Sherwood, Councilmember Lauren Tolmachoff, and Councilmember Bart Turner

*Also present were Richard Bowers, Acting City Manager; Jennifer Campbell, Assistant City Manager; Michael Bailey, City Attorney; Pamela Hanna, City Clerk; and Darcie McCracken, Deputy City Clerk.*

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE****CITIZEN COMMENTS**

*Larry Rovey, a Yucca resident, thanked Council for the service they provide and time they put in for the city. He also thanked them for bringing up this item and taking action. He said this zoning change would be a detriment to the city, the Airport and the neighbors in that area.*

*John Kaites, a Phoenix resident, said he represented the Chicago White Sox, the Los Angeles Dodgers and Camelback Ranch. He said they oppose this zoning case due to their partnership with Glendale and the traffic congestion this project will bring to the area. He mentioned the only way in and out of that area was Ballpark Blvd. He said an egress study was provided to the Councilmembers for the time it took to empty the area when games were held. He said it takes as long as an hour and a half to empty the area after a game. He said without a strategy for exiting that residential area, they do not feel it is appropriate to support this project. He said they want to work with Phoenix, Glendale and the neighbors in that area to extend Ballpark Blvd to the north to create another entrance and exit from that area. He thanked the Council for hearing this issue.*

*Mayor Weiers read a statement provided by Jan Anderson, a Glendale resident, which said, "I do not wish to speak about Thoroughbred Farms at 107th Avenue. I support the opposition to the proposed residential development at 107th Avenue north of Camelback Ranch Ball Park."*

**RESOLUTIONS**

1. [15-323](#) **OPPOSITION TO A PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT AT 107TH AVENUE AND CAMELBACK ROAD NEAR THE GLENDALE MUNICIPAL AIRPORT AND CAMELBACK RANCH**  
Staff Contact: Michael D. Bailey, City Attorney

*Mr. Bailey first thanked the city partners and Mr. Kaites, as well as Mr. Fix, Airport Administrator, and James Gruber, Assistant City Attorney. He spoke about the letter he sent to the City of Phoenix. He explained current zoning of the property is S-1SP, ranch or farm residence special permit, and this was part of the Camelback Ranch development and intended to be a golf course or mixed use. He also explained this property was intended to be a buffer for the Airport. He said the proposed zoning coming before the city of Phoenix will be R1-10, high density residential and the property will contain a proposed 190 residential units.*

Mr. Bailey provided a drawing of the proposed development and the surrounding area. He said the airport has been in operation at this location since 1986 and he said only 1,500 feet will separate the Airport property and the proposed high density residential area. Mr. Bailey also provided information on the air traffic patterns of the Glendale Airport, Luke Air Force Base and the Goodyear Airport. He explained in 2014, the Glendale Airport had over 68,000 airport operations, which are about 186 per day. He said the 2015 use numbers already exceed the numbers for last year, and are averaging over 230 operations per day. He said they are seeing an increase in traffic and influx of traffic during regionally important events, such as the Super Bowl. He said most of Glendale's flight pattern runs to the east of the Airport. He said there are restrictions for flight patterns to the west due to Luke Air Force Base. The drawing presented by Mr. Bailey showed the majority of flights will be right over the proposed development.

Mr. Bailey said the Phoenix report on this development showed open space to the west of the proposed development. This open space is a helicopter training area and has been a training area for some time. He said this training area will be a few hundred feet from proposed residences. He also provided video information about the current flight path of helicopters adjacent to the proposed development. He said not only will there be helicopters flying over the open area, they will also be hovering and landing in that area. He said the Helicopter Association International did a study about helicopter noise and it was found that the pulsating noise of a helicopter has a greater negative effect than airplane noise. Mr. Bailey explained that helicopters perceived noise level is equivalent to a Boeing 777 taking off. He provided a more detailed explanation about the noise level and said there might be 80 to 90 decibels of noise in that area, which might seriously impact the residences.

In summary, Mr. Bailey said a high density residential development is not a compatible use with an airport. He said the airport is an industrial use and there needs to be a buffer from any residential development with open space, low density residential or some type of mixed use. He said mixed use, such as a golf course, would be a good use for this space. Mr. Bailey said there are also requirements with the operations of the facility, such as the ingress and egress issues. He explained this property only has one point of access from a public safety standpoint. He said there will not be access off of 107th Avenue and Ballpark is the only point of access to the development. He said in the event there is a public safety event in that area, there will be a significant delay in public safety response to this area. He said there is a need for a secondary point of access into this area to alleviate harm to the facility, but also from a public safety standpoint. Final considerations included the property is 1,500 feet from the Airport runway and the proposed use is incompatible with existing development. Mr. Bailey explained no public airport in Maricopa County has homes within 1,500 feet of an airport runway. There are also transportation issues which impact Camelback Ranch operations, including the single point access for public safety, as well as a 25 minute egress for stadium operations. Mr. Bailey said they are sensitive to the issue of residences encroaching upon the airport. Mr. Bailey asked Council to consider and approve the resolution opposing the zoning case in the city of Phoenix. He said staff will continue to work with Phoenix to establish an appropriate use to include a buffer and to protect existing residences, baseball operations and Airport operations. He said this is an ongoing issue and will continue to seek resolution.

Councilmember Chavira addressed three concerns, including the residents of the city of Phoenix that are affected by this issue, citizens of the city of Glendale and the city's business partners, the Dodgers and White Sox. He explained the second concern if this project is allowed to happen, there will be a noise abatement problem. He said his greatest concern is the ingress and egress to the area, and this is a big concern for

public safety officials. He said he is adamantly opposed to this project and thanked everyone for their input on this issue.

Mayor Weiers said typically the Airport uses Runway 1 and using right traffic and if you are landing on 19, you are typically making left patterns. He said pilots don't typically try to have traffic on the west side of the Airport due to the power lines and the potential conflict with Luke Air Force Base. He asked if there were any other reasons why the Airport would not typically have traffic patterns on the west side of the Airport.

Mr. Fix said those examples were typical and there are a small number of flights on the west side. He said those are allowed with permission from the control tower and ideal conditions at the Base. He said some of the helicopter training does occur on the west side.

Mayor Weiers said he wanted to include the helicopter training on the west side also and he pointed out another concern, which was Luke Air Force Base. He said if the homes were built in that area, there would be many complaints about the noise and noise abatement would push more air traffic to the west side of the Airport. He was concerned about the amount of time all the cities in the state have put in to ensure the mission of Luke Air Force Base and now they would be in major conflict. He said this is a huge concern of his and he does not want this to become an issue. He said if homes are built in that area, the flights would be so close to the Airport, they would have to be extended further to start turns in to land. He explained this would push flights south or north over more residential areas. He said the solution would be to not allow any new homes to be built in that area.

Mr. Fix said Mayor Weiers was very accurate in his statements and it would be difficult to fly friendly.

Councilmember Aldama said the developer has required that a minimum of 33 percent of the homes have front porches, and he didn't think anyone would occupy the front porches with the type of noise they saw in the video. He also mentioned the 69 decibels of noise described by Mr. Bailey, and he quoted, "applicants shall provide with building plans, certification by an acoustical engineer or registered architect, specifying that the construction practices and/or materials of the unit will achieve a maximum interior noise of 45 decibels." He said is the industry standard and is not even enough to cover the 69 decibels or 62 decibels, nor the additional 6 or 7 decibels that may occur, depending on the flight pattern of the helicopter. He said that would be an injustice to the homeowners. He explained another red flag was "the property owner shall record a notice to prospective purchasers in proximity to the airport in order to disclose the existence and operational characteristics of Glendale Municipal Airport to future owners or tenants of the property." He said if he was a homebuyer and there were notices that there may be air traffic and there might be noise issues, the homes would stay empty for many years. He said he was disappointed that Phoenix might approve something like this and not encourage a better relationship with the city of Glendale.

Mayor Weiers said if you look at the numbers on the aviation map where it shows altitudes 90 and then shows 30 and 90 and 40 and 90 and 70, those are the maximum and minimums that small aircraft and large aircraft have to fly between. He said they have all experienced numerous phone calls about people upset about noise from airplanes. He said in Glendale you have to be over 3,000 feet over surface level. He said that is a concern if people typically complain about aircraft noise at 5,000 feet, as well as the possibility of helicopters landing. He said the complaints will really come in if these homes are built. He wanted to point out what those numbers mean.

Larry Rovey, a Yucca resident, said Phoenix neighbors have to complain to the city of Phoenix about the Glendale Airport. He also said petitions were circulated in Peoria as well about airport noise. He said it seems preposterous that this development would go through. He said the city needs to push forward with no residential in that area. He spoke about the city of Phoenix general plan amendment. He said the ultimate goal is for the sake of the Airport, the ballpark and the neighbors, no residences should be built.

Ms. Pamela Hanna read Resolution 4954 in its entirety, it being A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, EXPRESSING ITS OPPOSITION TO A PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT AT 107TH AVENUE AND CAMELBACK ROAD NEAR THE GLENDALE MUNICIPAL AIRPORT AND CAMELBACK RANCH.

WHEREAS, the Glendale Municipal Airport serves as a crucial reliever airport for Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport and accommodates air traffic and pilots from throughout the Phoenix metro area and;

WHEREAS, the Glendale Municipal Airport acts as an economic engine for Glendale and metro Phoenix; and

WHEREAS, residential development in close proximity to an airport is detrimental to the airport, as such development results in increased complaints regarding the airport from adjacent residents, particularly related to airplane and helicopter noise; and

WHEREAS, the proposed residential development by the Bela Flor developer at the northwest corner of 107th Avenue and Camelback Road, which is less than 1,500 feet from the Glendale Municipal Airport's runway is not an appropriate land use; and

WHEREAS, Camelback Ranch represents a regional partnership between the cities of Glendale and Phoenix to host the Los Angeles Dodgers and Chicago White Sox organizations in a premier baseball facility that operates nearly year-round; and

WHEREAS, the increased traffic and population density generated by the potential Bela Flor development will interfere with the use of and access to the facility by fans and the major league baseball organizations that train at the site; and

WHEREAS, Camelback Ranch leadership has joined the City of Glendale in voicing its opposition to the proposed Bela Flor development; and

WHEREAS, widespread neighborhood opposition to the proposed residential development has emerged from residents from both Phoenix and Glendale, causing the City of Phoenix's Maryvale Village Planning Committee to recommend that the Phoenix City Council reject the requested rezoning of the development.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE as follows:

SECTION 1. That the Glendale City Council opposes Bela Flor's rezoning and general plan amendment requests for land adjacent to the Glendale Municipal Airport and Camelback Ranch.

*SECTION 2. That the Glendale City Council requests and urges the Phoenix City Council to reject Bela Flor's rezoning and general plan amendment requests and all future requests for changes from S-1 SP to any higher density residential use of Maricopa County Parcel No. 102-59-023, Lot 8, in the Glendale Spring Training Complex.*

*SECTION 3. That the Glendale City Council directs the Glendale City Manager and City Attorney to take all reasonable, necessary and prudent actions to oppose Bela Flor's rezoning and general plan amendment requests.*

*PASSED, ADOPTED AND APPROVED by the Mayor and Council of the City of Glendale, Maricopa County, Arizona, this 5th day of May, 2015.*

**A motion was made by Councilmember Sherwood, seconded by Councilmember Chavira, that this agenda item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Mayor Weiers, Vice Mayor Hugh, Councilmember Aldama, Councilmember Chavira, Councilmember Sherwood, Councilmember Tolmachoff, and Councilmember Turner

### **COUNCIL COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS**

*The Council had no comments or suggestions.*

### **ADJOURNMENT**

*The meeting adjourned at 1:10 p.m.*