



**MINUTES OF THE
GLENDALE CITY COUNCIL SPECIAL WORKSHOP SESSION
Council Chambers, Rm B-3
5850 West Glendale Avenue
March 13, 2014
8:00 a.m.**

PRESENT: Mayor Jerry P. Weiers, Vice Mayor Yvonne J. Knaack and Councilmembers Norma S. Alvarez, Ian Hugh, Manuel D. Martinez, Gary D. Sherwood, and Samuel U. Chavira

ALSO PRESENT: Brenda Fischer, City Manager; Julie Frisoni, Assistant City Manager; Jennifer Campbell, Assistant City Manager; Michael Bailey, City Attorney; and Pamela Hanna, City Clerk

WORKSHOP SESSION

1. **FISCAL YEAR 2014 - 15 COUNCIL GOAL/PRIORITY SETTING**
FACILITATED BY: Richard A. Bowers, R. A. Bowers & Associates

Staff is seeking guidance from Council to formulate and finalize FY14-15 Council goals and set priorities based upon direction from the Council.

Mr. Bowers said the key strategic goals and priorities will be part of the upcoming budget discussion. Bowers listed the ground rules for the goal/priority discussion with City Council as: stay at the policy level; discuss the tough issues; agree on the vital few initiatives; be clear on outcome desires; be concise; identify next steps, and enjoy the day. He commented that City Council members should while discussing the Council's key strategic initiatives use courteous language, respect differences, be apolitical, and seek consensus.

Mr. Bowers listed City Council's 2013 retreat objectives as: acknowledge many good things are happening; stay aware of the City Council as a team; shorter meetings, informal workshops; agree to visit other cities; communicate with the public; focus on new City Manager expectations; stay strategic; find common ground, and clear understanding regarding finances and debt.

Mr. Bowers listed the greatest challenges faced by City Council in FY14 as: assure fiscal sustainability; form strong, communicative City Council; address big ones: hockey, baseball, centerline; audit to find firm factual base, find the right City Manager; establish

sound financial policies and practices; strengthen revenue while managing expenses; stronger cooperation within and between staff and Council, and keep the Glendale charm.

Councilmember Sherwood asked if it helped to go back and discuss any of what was said last year. He asked if they should start with last year's Strategic Goals and work forward from there. Mr. Bowers agreed. He planned to review FY14 Strategic Goals and Priorities then Council can discuss which goals should be deleted or added.

Mr. Bowers reviewed a summarized list of the current Strategic Goals and Priorities as follows:

- Transparency: Internally and externally for public trust...;
- Arena Management: debt service, hockey agreement...;
- Cooperation: among staff and City Council to better serve...;
- Fiscal Sustainability and associated commitments by policy...;
- Centerline and Community Events: need policy attention...;
- Service Levels: engaging and informing the community...;
- Creative, innovative, benchmarked ideas; entrepreneurial...;
- Plus substantial direction to strengthen and live in accordance with the Charter, Code, etc.

Mr. Bowers said he interviewed each of the Councilmembers before today's retreat. He listed several issues brought up for discussion today as follows:

- Take arena off list, add Camelback Ranch;
- Take out community events leave in Centerline;
- Take out service level... it's a given;
- Not personal, what is best for Glendale;
- Follow the Code of Conduct and other adopted commitments;
- Take politics out of the equation;
- Budget is No. 1..review quarterly;
- Understand what we can/can't do per Charter/Code/Open Meeting Law;
- Include measures for progress on goals;
- Commit to strategy for sustainability;
- Form strong alliances with the Chamber;
- Keep City Council equally informed.

Councilmember Martinez said with respect to taking out the community events, they should leave it in because they have reduced events but they are continuing to have them. Hopefully, someday, they can bring back some others that the public likes. He would like to it stay in there.

Vice Mayor Knaack agreed with taking the arena off the list and replacing it with Camelback Ranch. Councilmember Alvarez disagreed and noted that the vote on the arena management agreement was not unanimous. She said City Council must remember they didn't follow the Charter bidding process. Also, she continued they turned down a 6 million

dollar offer to manage the arena and went with 15 million dollar offer. The arena should stay on the list.

Mr. Bower commented last year the objective was to create an agreement which was the largest issue. He was not suggesting that City Council not keep their eyes on the arena.

Councilmember Martinez said last year at the retreat the arena management was unresolved and some of the Councilmembers may be unhappy with the result, but the agreement is done. He said they now get monthly or quarterly reports on the arena that was requested by the Council. He said the transparency is there. He also said everyone knows it is not doing as well as they thought it would. He said they can't keep the same things under key priorities because they do not like the result that came of the legislation that was made. He said people are very aware of this issue. He said it is proper to remove this item. He said there are some questions with respect to Camelback Ranch, and that is the way to go. He said that one was taken care of, as far as what needed to be done and now they have another one they have to zero in on and see what they can do with that.

Mr. Bowers said City Council took the policy action and now there are structures for the City Manager to report to Council on the arena. Councilmember Hugh said he could understand the management part being crossed off, but the arena is one of the city's biggest investments. He also said Camelback Ranch is a done deal as well. He understood leaving them on the list because they are a priority and there is so much money invested and those issues should be on Council's radar. He said they are both done deals and would leave them both on so they are looked at and talked about.

Mayor Weiers said he understood everyone's concern, but the management agreement is done. He said the critical part is the physical sustainability, arena management and transparency. He said they need to make sure they get what Council thinks they are getting. He said they have to stay on management as they need to make sure the job is done.

Mr. Bowers said the arena now becomes a management issue not policy issue. He said he understood there were more policy issues with Camelback Ranch.

Councilmember Hugh commented he didn't say manage the arena and Camelback Ranch but they are two of the biggest financial burdens of the city. He said the City Council needs to keep them a priority.

Vice Mayor Knaack said that they needed to stay at the policy level and remember the City Manager's management responsibility. However, she agreed that City Council will always have their eye on the arena and Camelback Ranch.

Councilmember Sherwood asked if they were talking about Council priorities, the priorities they want out of this Council for this coming fiscal year. He said last year the arena management was a big priority. He agreed that had been taken care of. He said Camelback Ranch would have been a priority last year had it not been for the arena. He said now this

Council's priority has been to relook at that situation because of the financial drain it is causing. He said many people will argue the merits of the arena management. He believed it is a priority of this Council for staff to work that issue. He said they have been doing that. He said Camelback Ranch should be up there in the place of arena management because it is a priority whether it is policy or not. He would like to see what components of that deal they can make better for the city.

Councilmember Sherwood said he felt they were in agreement if Camelback Ranch wasn't around, the budget situation would be so much better. He said it is a terrible contract and he thought it was the desire of the Council to do what they can to fix whatever components can be fixed on it.

Mr. Bowers said he was hearing two different opinions but it seems there is little support for keeping the arena on the list. As for Camelback Ranch it wouldn't be a policy issue this year but Council wants to watch both the arena and Camelback Ranch.

Councilmember Chavira said he agreed that the policy has already been set and they have the administrative maintenance with the arena and Camelback Ranch. He said this falls under the fiscal sustainability component under that umbrella.

Councilmember Hugh said he could understand removing the management portion of the arena off the list but being the biggest investment the city has, the arena should be kept on the list. He added one reason to leave the arena as a top priority is the recent downgrade in the bond rating, which specifically mentions the arena as a problem. Councilmember Hugh continued Camelback Ranch is another key to the budget but they are both done deals with signed contracts.

Mr. Bowers said he was hearing two different opinions but it seems there is little support for the arena and Camelback Ranch as policy issues this year. He understands that Council wants to watch them closely.

Mr. Bowers asked if cooperation should be highlighted as a key objective and noted there will be new councilmembers this year.

Councilmember Martinez said he didn't think they need it as a policy issue as opposed to an operation. He said it sounds good, but asked what does it do. He said there is nothing they can really zero in on the operation. He said it is something that is expected of them as a Council. He said he did think it fit in there.

Mayor Weiers said he agreed with that.

Councilmember Chavira said he is in agreement and liked the fact that cooperation was brought up. He said they have several documents to support it. He said this should always be part of their decorum and the way they treat each other and the way they act to represent the city. He said just bringing up cooperation sets the tone for the day.

Vice Mayor Knaack read one of the statements from last year about cooperation? She said Councilmembers need to set the tone for the entire city and one of the detriments of not cooperating is that businesses coming here want Council working together but she didn't think it should be a policy decision, it is something Council is obligated to do

Councilmember Alvarez said cooperation goes both ways, not here to agree with everything, in the community talk to people going to research and make up own mind and speak up when something's wrong. She continued that is part of transparency. She said they don't have to like the Council or colleagues, but she has to work with them. She noted that Council couldn't talk about executive session discussion. She said that is why she does not like executive session because a lot of things are talked about that the public should hear. She said they have to obey the law but there are some issues that she thinks are unethical and immoral. She said putting cooperation as a policy is not going to do any good and she will speak up when she sees wrong.

Mr. Bowers said when it comes to strategic objectives there are some things that all should agree to and one of those things is civility. He stated none of this is looking at specific Councilmembers.

Mr. Bower said he would remove cooperation from the list but it does not change code of conduct and ethics.

Councilmember Alvarez said Council had all violated that and she had done it especially when someone is attacking her ethnicity. She said for example saying all of us are compadres. She said if someone says something insulting to her then she was going to react. She added that Council had all violated that and wanted to attack where it hurts more.

Mr. Bowers said he was not speaking about different personalities this is about what Councilmembers have agreed to even if he/she is intense about it; it is not okay particularly on television.

Councilmember Martinez said the Council does not always agree on everything, but to say they have done things that are unethical or immoral, that is something else. He said it gets back to if someone has done something unethical or immoral, they have the code of conduct and they have the code of ethics to be used for that.

Councilmember Alvarez said compadre.

Councilmember Martinez said there is something he picked out of a government magazine and he thought this might come up again. He read what it said about the Las Comadres Rule He said this rule would apply also to compadre. "For Latinas, comadre is a powerful term. Your comadre can be your friend, sister, confidant, mentor, neighbor, and godmother, or your children. Sometimes all of the above. But mostly a comadre is someone you can count on when the going gets tough as it often does. Moving examples of this can be found in 'Count On Me', a collection of tales of sisterhood and fierce friendships. They were

compiled by Nora Comstock, President and CEO of the organization Las Comadres para las Americas , together with author Adriana Lopez. Contributors included Latina writers such as Esmeralda Santiago, Sofia Quintero, Reyna Grande and even a stray comadre, Luis Alberto Urrea, and below is an excerpt from Real Sisters by Stephanie Elizadro Ruiz.”

Councilmember Martinez said during the Yarnell Fire, one of the firefighters referred to his colleagues as his compadres when speaking about the firefighters that died. He said that is a term that is very well accepted, compadre and comadres. He said it is a term of endearment and friendship. He said he did not understand how this could be taken as offensive.

Mr. Bowers asked what position the Council had on Centerline, he understood there was new leadership at the Chamber of Commerce and they were more engaged.

Councilmember Martinez said Centerline should be kept because they really haven't been able to address it the way it should be due to the economy and resources. It is still important and they need to keep it listed.

Mr. Bowers asked if there was policy to be made. Councilmember Martinez responded that there is but it hasn't been done. Councilmember Chavira said he agreed Centerline is the heart of the city and is city's identity so deserves attention. It needs to be a priority.

Vice Mayor Knaack agreed Centerline includes the court building which still needs to be completed. She said Council hasn't been focused on it because of the financial situation but she agreed to leave it on the list.

Councilmember Sherwood said the alternative route study on light rail is next year and has a lot to do with Centerline. He noted there are decisions coming up in the near term such as gateway sports and entertainment

Vice Mayor Knaack said events are separate from Centerline and we need to look at outside resources for the events.

Mr. Bower asked if Council felt events should be up here but separate from Center line. Mayor Weiers said events are a major part of the City of Glendale.

Councilmember Martinez said the policy on Centerline has been made. He said it's there to be done, but it hasn't been done.

Councilmember Chavira said he agreed. He said Centerline is not only the heart of the city, but it is their identity. He said the city is unique and it needs the attention it deserves. He said extenuating circumstances have kept them from addressing this issue. He said they do need to make this a priority.

Councilmember Alvarez said Council needs to advise the citizens what Centerline is and that it is not a repeat of Sonorita.

Vice Mayor Knaack said she agreed that Centerline was important and they needed to focus on it.

Councilmember Sherwood said the alternative study going on for the light rail will be due the middle of next year. He said that has a lot to do with Centerline. He said it will be something they will be dealing with anyway. He said they do not have a lot of money devoted to that right now, but in terms of the future, there are decisions coming up that would affect that. He said it needs to stay on the list. He also said it is somewhat a gateway out to the sports and entertainment area.

Mayor Weiers said there is no doubt that events are a major part of this state and he didn't think anyone would argue that point.

Mr. Bowers reviewed the list of priorities. He asked what did Council want on service levels do they feel it is still policy.

Councilmember Sherwood said that gets into what has been discussed in prior workshops in terms of alternative service level, delivery and he said that direction has already been given to staff. He said it should be Council's goal to determine if alternative service levels will save the city money. He said they have asked staff to explore this and it is important in this fiscal year. He said it would be appropriate.

Mayor Weiers said he has not heard anyone mention the Super Bowl and that is an absolute priority. He said it is an event and public safety is a huge portion of that event. He said that should probably be at the top of the list since it is only about 11 months away.

Councilmember Sherwood asked if that was a policy.

Mayor Weiers said it was a priority.

Mr. Bowers said there are number of policy issues that will come to Council related to the Super Bowl. Mayor Weiers said Council had addressed some of this already. Councilmember Martinez agreed. Councilmember Sherwood said Council might want to categorize the Super Bowl that requires Council involvement as major events. Mayor Weiers said the public safety is one of the biggest issues. Mayor Weiers said other things will come, but public safety is specific and time sensitive.

Mayor Weiers said he has tried to do different ride-a-longs and has done different events. He said he is able to this on his time with staff's schedule. He said he tries to be conscious of staff time. He said it is difficult.

Vice Mayor Knaack asked whether the innovate program was still active. Ms. Fisher responded no. Vice Mayor Knaack said that it too bad, some great ideas and savings came out of it? Ms. Fischer said the staff position is assigned to another area right now where there was a shortage. She said creative and innovative ideas are something she stresses to

the departments every day. Even though there is not a person assigned to that right now, she said she challenges staff every day to look for ways to save. She also said they have the employee driven R & R Committee and they are taking over some of that innovate role. They are bringing up a lot of ideas and many of the budget savings are the result of employees looking at ways to save.

Councilmember Sherwood said we all do that, on the boards they serve on or when they go to other cities' events. He said they are always thinking of that and it is good to have it out there. He said right now it is tough, but they try and pick up any idea they can.

Mayor Weiers said the fiscal standing has to be the priority. He said if they don't get that under control, none of the other stuff makes any difference. Mayor Weiers said the city has to be able to sustain it. He said the City Manager is working diligently trying to work some of the issues out. He said fiscal sustainability is the priority and the transparency has to be right up there with it.

Councilmember Chavira said he agreed. He said the economic development department is the most innovative around. He said they are aggressive and the services the city offers attracts big business to the city.

Mayor Weiers said with the economic development, it takes in all the other stuff. He said the city needs the transparency, fiscal sustainability, and public safety. He also said that Centerline may be a possibility for real growth within the city. He said it goes without saying that they understand that is going to be a priority all the time. He said they have a great team and he said this is important.

Councilmember Sherwood agreed with the Mayor. He said if that was a priority, it was a priority every year. He said unless there was a specific new area of the city they wanted to focus on, these are more of an everyday thing.

Councilmember Martinez agreed and said economic development is a lifeline and they don't get enough credit for the job they do. He gave the example of the recent American Furniture Warehouse project and there were even people on the Council that were critical because it moved so fast through the city's development process. He said that was to their credit, the fact it is very competitive out there. He said staff is ready to do that and said kudos to them. He said if the city doesn't get out in front and offer the services in a timely manner, someone else will jump in and get it. He said it was important to highlight it.

Councilmember Chavira said he wanted to add the 303 pre-annexation processes they are doing to the list since it is the city's future. He said people don't know how big this is. He said this will add to the sustainability of Luke Air Force Base by limiting residential encroachment and inviting industrial and commercial businesses. He said he can't imagine how big that will be.

Mr. Bowers reviewed the final list of new Strategic Goals and Priorities as follows:

- Super Bowl/public safety;
- Fiscal sustainability;
- Transparency;
- Centerline
- Major Events;
- Service level options;
- Economic Development;
- Innovative benchmarked ideas.

Mayor Weiers said Council has the goals and priorities.

Mayor Weiers called for a five minute break.

Mr. Bowers said there was another component to this. He said over the course of time they have been open on their expectations of one another and how meetings proceed and how the code of ethics and code of conduct is followed. He said the City Manager has suggested that these two be blended together because they have too many things to read to get to the point. He shared a couple of points out of the material that relates to the Council management form of government.

Mr. Bowers said when Councilmembers spoke about their concerns about civility and decorum. He said sanctions were built into the code of conduct and code of ethics as a mechanism for correction. He said Council supported the need for civility and decorum as a matter of policy, not as a matter of choice. He said civility and decorum in discussions and debates that are in the public arena.

Mr. Bowers said the second point is they should treat all staff as professionals. He said he did not select this himself but it came from the conversation with Councilmembers. He said Council needs to be consistent making sure that they treat staff as professionals and that criticism is never given in public. He also suggested limiting contact with staff as is directed by the City Manager. He said he has done work for some cities where no Councilmember may contact any staff member except through management. He said that is not the case in Glendale, but limitations are still there. He said a Councilmember cannot have regular meetings with staff unless those regular meetings are shared with all other Councilmembers.

Mayor Weiers asked about the statements Mr. Bowers just made and asked how it works as far as lunches, dinners or other situations like that. He asked if they should stay away from that and asked Mr. Bowers to clarify.

Mr. Bowers said he spoke from an administrative perspective, but not as an attorney, and suggested they check with the attorney. He said if those opportunities have a conversation that is substantive in information that is shared there, which might be appropriate for other Councilmembers, that information should be shared with the other Councilmembers.

Mr. Bowers said unless it is substantive don't interrupt staff from their jobs to take your call, leave a message and they will get back to you. Mr. Bowers spoke about another idea that Councilmembers are not welcome at staff meetings unless invited for a specific purpose to have a conversation. He said the moment a Councilmember walks into a staff meeting, that staff meeting has ended. He asked Council to understand that administration has to perform Charter responsibilities independent of Council, but also interdependent on Council.

Councilmember Alvarez asked about attending a commission meeting.

Mr. Bowers said that was a whole different ballgame because those members are appointed by the Councilmember. He said he is talking very strictly about staff. He said the way the Charter is in Glendale is very clear.

Mayor Weiers suggested Mr. Bailey could address that.

Mr. Bailey said nothing prohibits Council from attending committee meetings but he cautioned against it because they could influence by attendance. He suggested they can watch from home and in some situations they might have to recuse themselves if they attend and the issue comes to Council. He thought they should avoid it.

Vice Mayor Knaack said she had attended a few Boards and Commission meetings but had been invited.

Mr. Bailey suggested if wishing to attend let all Councilmembers and the City Manager know in advance. He said it can change the dynamic of the meeting and it is a courtesy among Council so everyone has the option to attend.

Mayor Weiers suggested if they felt compelled to show up, show up at the beginning, thank the people for doing their job and then get out. He said he thought everyone understood that.

Councilmember Martinez said recently he was invited to attend a commission meeting and he went. They asked him to stay and he told them he appreciated their service but would not be staying for the meeting.

Mr. Bailey said it is appropriate Council should have a policy that a Board or Commission not invite any Councilmembers unless all are invited. He noted when a Commission decision is coming to Council, then Council shouldn't attend the Commission meeting.

Mayor Weiers said in the near future we should come up with Council policy on this.

Mr. Bailey said to clarify one of the challenges is Council doesn't know when other Councilmembers are attending meetings, open up and invite everyone

Vice Mayor Knaack said it would have to be posted

Mr. Bailey said if Council comes up with policy then the code of conduct should be amended.

Councilmember Martinez said if he got a call from a board or commission member, he would say invite all the Mayor and Council.

Mayor Weiers said in the near future, they should come up with a Council policy on that. He said it is dangerous if they invite everyone, but if two people show up nothing has changed. He said sometimes people are voting based on who is looking at them. He said that could be a major problem and said they needed to address that as a Council in the future.

Councilmember Martinez said if they do come up with a policy, they need to amend the code of conduct in keeping with the policy.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:46 a.m.